

MINUTES
TOWN OF FORT MILL
HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD
May 11th, 2021
Virtual Meeting
4:30 PM

Present: Chairman Louis Roman, David Booth, Megan Brinton, Scott Couchenour, Elizabeth Leventis, Samantha Nifong, Jessica Scarlett, Planning Director Penelope Karagounis, Senior Planner Alex Moore

Guests: Les Spencer

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Louis Roman called the meeting to order at 4:30 PM.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairman Louis Roman entertained a motion to approve the minutes. Mr. Couchenour made a motion to approve the minutes from the April 13th, 2021, meeting as presented. Samantha Nifong seconded the motion to approve the minutes. The minutes were then approved by a vote of 7-0.

OLD BUSINESS

Chairman Louis Roman opened the meeting by noting the contents of the agenda and the associated packet of information.

OLD BUSINESS ITEM

The old business included an agenda item from the April 13th, 2021, meeting which was deferred. This included the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the replacement of windows at St. John's United Methodist Church. At the April 13th meeting, the historic review board (HRB) deferred a decision on the proposal for replacement windows at St. John's UMC until they received additional product information.

Senior Planner Moore gave an overview of the supplementary information provided by St. John's UMC in relation to the windows. This included a spreadsheet with prices for Pella and Andersen series brands along with a brief description of each type. Moore also noted that the applicant had received a verbal estimate from an Andersen window representative on the cost of repairing the windows.

Moore then asked the representative from St. John's UMC, Les Spencer, if he had anything to add to this information.

Mr. Spencer added that it was the church sanctuary building which is the most significant architectural portion of the property. His point in mentioning this was that the windows under consideration within the educational building were of less historical importance than the stained-glass windows within the sanctuary section of the church. Moreover, he added that the proposed Pella replacement windows were very much in character with the building forms within which they would be located in.

Megan Brinton then asked if any of the replacement windows would be part of the sanctuary building, or were they all to be within the educational building?

Mr. Spencer stated that all the windows would be located within the educational building.

Chairman Roman asked if there were any further comments or questions.

Jessica Scarlett asked if the general state of the windows indicated that they all needed to be replaced at this time, or conversely was it ever considered to only replace the

Mr. Spencer indicated that he personally had not performed a window-by-window inspection, but that he had probably looked at the worst cases. From this he had deduced that if all such windows had deteriorated in such a manner, then it made more sense to go ahead and replace all of the windows at once rather than replace them incrementally.

Mr. Spencer then added that some of the windows in question have already been replaced at some point. He based this finding on the fact that these windows did not possess uniform counterbalance systems.

Chairman Roman then asked if there were any other questions on the information as presented.

Ms. Brinton asked about the information pertaining to the window representative regarding the cost of window repair rather than window replacement. Specifically, Ms. Brinton's question was if Mr. Spencer had gotten this from the window representative or from the company that could perform the restoration?

Mr. Spencer stated that he received this information from the window representative.

Ms. Brinton indicated that her concern with this is that she felt the window representative was simply trying to sell the church new, replacement windows rather than providing them with actual information on a viable refurbishment professional.

There being no other questions or comments, Chairman Roman entertained a motion.

Scott Couchenour made a motion that the HRB approve the Pella 250 replacement windows.

Samantha Nifong seconded this motion.

Scott Couchenour then asked Chairman Roman for the opportunity to discuss. He then stated that he liked the fact that all the windows would be replaced at one time and that the storm windows would be permanently removed. Thus, he believed that this would provide a cohesive look to the educational section of the church.

Chairman Roman noted that this was a sensible comment and asked if there was any other discussion before the vote was taken.

There being none, Chairman Roman asked for a roll-call vote.

Planning Director Karagounis then noted that there was a motion to approve from Scot Couchenour and a second from Samantha Nifong. She then undertook a roll-call vote:

Elizabeth Leventis: *Aye*

Scott Couchenour: *Aye*

Jessica Scarlett: *Aye*

Samantha Nifong: *Aye*

David Booth: *Aye*

Megan Brinton: *Nay*.

Chairman Louis Roman: *Abstain*

Planning Director Karagounis then stated that since Chairman Roman abstained, she would need to email him a form to complete.

Thus, the application for the certificate of appropriateness (COA) for the Pella 250 series replacement windows at St. John's UMC as presented was approved by a vote of 5 to 1.

Additionally, with her vote of "Nay," Ms. Brinton had asked for an opportunity to discuss her reasoning. Thus, Planning Director Karagounis gave her the floor to do this.

Ms. Brinton stated that she did like the idea that all of the windows within the educational building would be replaced at the same time, that the number of window openings would remain the same, that the size of the windows would not be changing, and that the general design was remaining the same.

However, Ms. Brinton indicated that she was a bit concerned that more information was not known about the age of the building and that the town's historic district design guidelines clearly indicate that vinyl windows are not appropriate. She stated that in some cases that the use of vinyl windows may be necessary, but without exhausting all other options, the historic district guidelines need to be adhered to.

Chairman Roman thanked Ms. Brinton for her comments.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 4:52 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Alex J. Moore, AICP
Senior Planner
June 10th, 2021